Promoting Critical Thinking During New Nurse Transition to Practice

Lorene Todd Putnam, MSN, RN, CNE
Ann Putnam Johnson, EdD, RN, CNE
Session Objectives

• Discuss evidence based preceptor strategies to promote critical thinking in new nurses.
• Identify effective strategies to evaluate the critical thinking skill of the new nurse.
Background - Condition of Traditional Clinical Experiences in Schools of Nursing

• Faculty-student interactions (Wang & Blumberg, 1995; Polifroni, et al., 1995)
  – Time spent
  – Types of interactions
• Impact of clinical learning environments on experiences (Myrick & Yonge, 2004)
• Impact of schools increasing enrollments
• Anecdotal reports of time spent on tasks
Preceptor Preparation – Our Lived Experience

• Three Programs
  – Student Preceptors
  – New Graduate/New Employee Preceptors
  – Advanced Preceptors
• Based on literature and experience
• Nine Years of Programs
Sample Agenda – Precepting New Graduates: Not Just Another Day on the Job!

Components of Effective Orientation Program
Effective Communication
Teaching/Learning Principles
Promoting Critical Thinking
Planning for Reality Shock
Providing Proactive Feedback and Evaluation
Addressing Difficult Situations
Expectations of New Graduate and Preceptor
What the Literature Tells Us About Preceptor Preparation....

• Many studies of student/new graduate outcomes do not report information about preceptor preparation
• Some studies report little to no preparation
• How many of us have been placed in positions without preparation?
Preceptor Preparation to Promote and Support Critical Thinking – Reported in Literature

• Cognitive Skills
• Feedback/Evaluation
• Impact of Work Environment
Cognitive Skills
Cognitive Skills of Critical Thinking

- Divergent thinking
- Reflection
- Creativity
- Clarification

- Instructional Paradigm – Cognitive Apprenticeship
Divergent Thinking

• Defined:
  – The ability to analyze diverse opinions and judgment

• Suggested questions:
  – Of the data, which are the most relevant to the care of this client?
  – How do you know this intervention is effective? Ineffective?
Reflection

• Defined:
  – To ponder, contemplate, or deliberate
  – Recognizes that critical thinking is not linear
  – Integrates new ideas or insights
  – Integrates past experiences
  – Explores potential alternatives
  – Draw relationships - “if...then”
Reflection

• Suggested questions:
  – What are your main concerns in this situation?
  – How can you test the appropriateness of your interventions?
  – What evidence supports your conclusion?
  – What do you think you should do next?
  – What can wait until later?

(Nelson, Apenhorst, Carter, Mahlum, & Schneider, 2004)
Creativity

- Defined:
  - Produce ideas and alternatives
  - Consider multiple solutions

- Suggested questions:
  - What are some alternative solutions?
  - What is a new way to do this?
Clarification

• Defined:
  – Involves skills of noting similarities and differences, identifying assumptions, and defining terms

• Suggested Questions:
  – Compare and contrast concepts
  – What are the assumptions?
  – What are the meanings of the terms?
Cognitive Apprenticeship

• Modeling
• Coaching
• Scaffolding
• Articulation
• Reflection
• Exploration
• Fading

Collins, Brown, & Holum, 1991;
Taylor & Care, 1999
• **Modeling**
  – Preceptor performs a task
  – New nurse observes – builds conceptual model

• **Coaching**
  – Preceptor offers hints, support, & feedback
  – Aimed at bringing the new nurse’s performance closer to expert’s behavior
• Scaffolding
  – Preceptor uses many types of support
  – Provides ‘just enough’ support/guidance

• Articulation
  – Student describes knowledge, reasons, or thinking processes
  – In this way knowledge and processes can be observed, understood, shared
• Reflection
  – Compare practice to previous practice or with the practice of expert practitioners (i.e. preceptor)

• Exploration
  – Preceptor helps find opportunities for new nurse to pose and solve real problems
• Fading
  – As new nurse becomes more competent, preceptor gradually withdraws
  – New nurse moves from ‘other’ to ‘self’-regulation
Impact of Feedback/Evaluation on the Development of Critical Thinking
Feedback/Evaluation

• Skills that need to be explicitly taught and practiced
• Skillfully done, feedback can help new nurses in their thinking processes
• Consider generational issues
• New nurses report wanting more feedback
• Frequently cited as an important skill in effective precepting
Impact of Work Environment on Critical Thinking
## Relational Process – Impact on Critical Thinking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inhibits</th>
<th>Promotes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Role conscious</td>
<td>• Respect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Constraining</td>
<td>• Flexibility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Closed</td>
<td>• Openness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Unsafe</td>
<td>• Trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Unquestioning</td>
<td>• Skepticism</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Myrick and Yonge, 2004)
Learning in Practice – Situated Learning

- Reflection in action
- Legitimate peripheral participation
- Communities of practice
- Authentic activities

Lave & Wenger, 1991;
Taylor & Care, 1999
Evaluating Critical Thinking
Instruments to Evaluate Critical Thinking

- Tools specific to nursing are not readily available (Simpson & Courtney, 2002)
- Watson-Glasser Critical Thinking Assessment
- California Critical Thinking Test
Other Methods to Evaluate/Assess Critical Thinking

• Clinical simulation rating critical thinking (Todd, et al., 2008)

• Clinical decision making via computer (Finke, et al., 2001)

• Nurse Competence Scale (Meretoja, Isoaho, & Leino-Kilpi (2004))
Other Methods to Evaluate/Assess Critical Thinking

• Analysis of journaling regarding situation analysis (Sorrell, et al., 1997)

• Reflective contextual learning intervention (CLI) (Forneris & Peden-McAlpine, 2007)

• Context dependent items (Oermann, et al., 2000)